1	
2	NASSAU COUNTY LEGISLATURE
3	
4	
5	PETER SCHMITT, Presiding Officer
6	Presiding Officer
7	
8	
9	HEALTH AND SOCIAL SERVICES COMMITTEE
10	PUBLIC WORKS COMMITTEE
11	
12	ROSE MARIE WALKER,
13	Chairwoman
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	1550 Franklin Avenue Mineola, New York
19	MINEOLA, NEW IOLK
20	
21	Monday Tuly 9 2012
22	Monday, July 9, 2012 4:10 P.M
23	
24	
25	

1	
2	MEMBERS OF HEALTH COMMITTEE:
3	ROSE MARIE WALKER
4	Chairwoman
5	FRANCIS BECKER Vice Chairman
6	VINCENT MUSCARELLA
7	NORMA GONSALVES
8	JUDI BOSWORTH,
9	Ranking
10	DELIA DeRIGGI-WHITTON
11	ROBERT TROIANO (Not Present)
12	MEMBERS OF PUBLIC WORKS COMMITTEE:
13	
14	VINCENT MUSCARELLA, Chairman
15	HOWARD KOPEL,
16	Vice Chairman
17	FRANCIS BECKER
18	NORMA GONSALVES
19	DAVID DENENBERG, Ranking
20	JOSEPH SCANNELL
21	CARRIE SOLAGES
22	WILLIAM MULLER,
23	Clerk of the Legislature
24	

1	
2	LIST OF SPEAKERS
3	
4	DR. LAWRENCE EISENSTEIN, Nassau County Commissioner of Health
5	SHEILA SHAH, Nassau County
6	Department of Health
7	ANTHONY FALCO, Nassau County, Mosquito control63
8	Mosquito contitui
9	
10	
11	
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	

Health/Social	Services	7 - 9 - 1 2
---------------	----------	-------------

- 3 the Health and Social Services Committee and
- 4 Public Works Committee to order. I would
- 5 ask Mr. Muller to take the roll.
- 6 CLERK MULLER: Legislator
- 7 Troiano?
- 8 (No verbal response.)
- 9 CLERK MULLER: Legislator
- 10 DeRiggi-Whitton?
- 11 LEGISLATOR DERIGGI-WHITTON:
- 12 Here.
- 13 CLERK MULLER: Ranking Member
- 14 Bosworth?
- 15 LEGISLATOR BOSWORTH: Here.
- 16 CLERK MULLER: Legislator
- 17 Gonsalves?
- 18 LEGISLATOR GONSALVES: Present.
- 19 CLERK MULLER: Legislator
- 20 Muscarella?
- 21 LEGISLATOR MUSCARELLA: Here.
- 22 CLERK MULLER: Vice Chairman
- 23 Becker?
- 24 LEGISLATOR BECKER: Present.
- 25 CLERK MULLER: Chairwoman Rose

- 2 Walker?
- 3 CHAIRWOMAN WALKER: Here.
- 4 CLERK MULLER: And also on the
- 5 Public Works Committee, Legislator Solages?
- 6 LEGISLATOR SOLAGES: Here.
- 7 CLERK MULLER: Legislator
- 8 Scannell?
- 9 LEGISLATOR SCANNELL: Here.
- 10 CLERK MULLER: Ranking Member
- 11 Denenberg?
- 12 LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: Here.
- 13 CLERK MULLER: Vice chairman
- 14 Kopel?
- 15 LEGISLATOR KOPEL: Here.
- 16 CLERK MULLER: And every member
- 17 of that committee is here. And Legislator
- 18 Bosworth is sitting in as well.
- 19 CHAIRWOMAN WALKER: Thank you. I
- 20 would like to introduce Dr. Eisenstein who
- 21 is going to speak to us this afternoon.
- DR. EISENSTEIN: Good afternoon
- 23 and thank you everybody.
- Legislators, it's my great honor
- 25 to be here today to talk about something

- 2 that I've probably spoken to you all more
- 3 about than every other issue combined, which
- 4 is mosquitos and mosquito control.
- 5 When we spoke last summer when we
- 6 were talking about spraying and dealing with
- 7 West Nile, we mentioned that we were going
- 8 to completely overhaul our mosquito control
- 9 plan and present to you what our plan is
- 10 going forward and how it's going to affect
- 11 your residents.
- I want to take a moment before we
- 13 begin to say, over all winter, the mosquito
- 14 experts in the Department of Health and
- 15 along with our experts in public works,
- 16 collaborated to come together on the very
- 17 large document, which I left with Clerk
- 18 Muller, everybody should have a copy of
- 19 that, as well as the presentation that I'm
- 20 going to do briefly.
- 21 We're going to keep it brief but
- 22 try to be thorough at the same time, which
- 23 will describe our response to mosquitos
- 24 which, right now, we get a lot of
- 25 complaints, public works gets a lot of

- 2 complaints. Certainly I have interacted
- 3 with many of you regarding mosquito control.
- 4 I want to thank Commissioner
- 5 Shah. She's been a wonderful partner as
- 6 have her experts, and with us today from
- 7 DPW, Anthony Falco and John Gallo. And from
- 8 my department, Angela Petinelli has been the
- 9 liaison and they've been working around the
- 10 clock along with Ken Arnold from DPW to
- 11 update and modernize the document that you
- 12 have.
- We have seen new viruses and new
- 14 mosquito species come to our area, and it
- 15 really does impact life on a daily basis and
- 16 certainly can present a health threat which
- 17 is why I'm leading this discussion.
- 18 Following this, the
- 19 administration is going to be having forums
- 20 throughout the county and a schedule will be
- 21 coming out and published where I willing be
- 22 going, along with some of the other experts,
- 23 to meet the public to answer their questions
- 24 and questions.
- We know up front that mosquito

- 2 control spraying and other efforts, it's not
- 3 unanimous about how the public feels about
- 4 it. We will get two neighbors who one
- 5 strongly wants to be sprayed and the other
- 6 who doesn't.
- 7 The most important thing that I
- 8 can tell you is that the document that you
- 9 have before you, the control plan that we're
- 10 going to be presenting, has been created
- 11 with the most modern science that we have
- 12 available. We explored what's being done in
- 13 other counties that have mosquito issues
- 14 throughout the United States.
- 15 We have read the documentation of
- 16 the CDC, we have the guidance of the New
- 17 York State Health Department and the work is
- 18 a collaboration of our experts and DPW's
- 19 experts to try to present the residents of
- 20 Nassau County with the safest, smartest
- 21 mosquito control plan.
- So, with that, in the first
- 23 slide, just take a look at a truck from the
- 24 1950s, and mosquito control is something
- 25 that has long historical significance.

- 2 As a matter of fact, at the turn
- 3 of the century, Malaria was one of the
- 4 number one killers even here in New York.
- 5 And people don't ever think of Malaria as a
- 6 disease in the United States, but its
- 7 mosquito control efforts that eliminated it.
- 8 And Malaria today still kills millions of
- 9 people around the world, but I'm happy to
- 10 say it's not endemic in the United States
- 11 any cases that we do see here which we do
- 12 see once in a while are usually brought in
- 13 by travelers.
- 14 We used to spray kerosene on
- 15 waterways and it was quite an effective way
- 16 of controlling mosquitos, but it was also of
- 17 course very toxic. So, over the years, the
- 18 chemicals that have been used to treat
- 19 mosquitos have changed. I'm glad the
- 20 experts John and Anthony are here should you
- 21 have any questions on that at the end they
- 22 should be able to address that.
- 23 A mosquito control commission was
- 24 created in the 1920s in response to a yellow
- 25 fever epidemic that was ravaging the

- 2 southern part of the United States, which,
- 3 the fear was, it would come up north, and it
- 4 really didn't, but Yellow Fever and Malaria
- 5 are diseases that do kill millions of people
- 6 around the world, were once part of the
- 7 United States and they have been in the
- 8 history of the United States. So you can
- 9 see why it's very important as new viruses
- 10 emerge that we address this.
- In 1948, the county charter wrote
- 12 mosquito control into DPW as a control
- 13 response, and we have worked when disease
- 14 has been part of it as partners.
- In 1996, a coordinated effort was
- 16 made to bring DPW and the health department
- 17 together to control mosquito borne diseases
- 18 and, in 1999, West Nile Virus made a
- 19 reappearance in Nassau that came here very
- 20 hard after not being here for a very, very
- 21 long time.
- 22 We are going to be talking about
- 23 our surveillance and rehabilitation
- 24 measures. The purpose of what we're doing,
- 25 well, it's twofold. We've been asked many

- 2 times that due to the unusually mild winter,
- 3 do we anticipate a large population of
- 4 mosquitos? The answer is, it certainly
- 5 could be. Other factors do play into it,
- 6 but we're being very proactive.
- 7 We do know, going back to last
- 8 year, not only from Hurricane Irene, but if
- 9 you remember about two weeks before
- 10 Hurricane Irene, a tremendous rainstorm
- 11 dumped about ten to 12 inches on the county
- 12 which raised the water table, and then this
- 13 big windstorm came spreading mosquito
- 14 breeding grounds everywhere.
- 15 We have had basically relentless
- 16 numbers of mosquitos last summer and now
- 17 this spring we've had the complaints. Early
- in the spring we got complaints about
- 19 mosquitos, and it turned out to be gnats in
- 20 most cases, but I don't deny for a second
- 21 that even in my own backyard there's a lot
- 22 of mosquitos, and I have small children who
- 23 like to play back there.
- So the purpose is to create a
- 25 plan that reduces the large populations of

- 2 mosquitos, and we'll show you data that
- 3 shows that that should also reduce levels of
- 4 disease.
- 5 We talk about spraying and so we
- 6 want residents to be aware of what the truck
- 7 might look like. If they see this driving
- 8 down the street with Anthony shooting the
- 9 gun, it's not a UFO, it's not an alien.
- 10 They'll be in a mask. But this is, from the
- 11 distance, what the truck might look like. A
- 12 close-up of the fogger that dispenses
- 13 pesticides when we do ground spraying.
- 14 Although we have dozens of
- 15 mosquitos, there are three main mosquitos.
- 16 First is the Culex Pipien. That is the
- 17 mosquito that you see that comes out around
- 18 dusk. You see it hovering around lights at
- 19 night. It is the mosquito that's most known
- 20 to transmit West Nile Virus and it's the one
- 21 most effectively treated at this point by
- 22 spraying.
- 23 The second kind of mosquito we
- 24 call sollicitans. This is the one that, if
- you're out at the beach, and around 7

- 2 o'clock, all of a sudden a billion mosquitos
- 3 attack you out of the blue, this is likely
- 4 to be the sollicitans, which is the salt
- 5 marsh mosquito. This is known more to be a
- 6 nuisance rather than a disease carrying
- 7 mosquito, although all mosquitos can carry
- 8 disease, but certainly in certain places,
- 9 outside of Nassau, there is precedence for
- 10 treating this. Suffolk County does this in
- 11 Fire Island because it's basically unusable
- 12 as a tourist destination without it. So
- it's something that we aggressively
- 14 larvicide and try to prevent.
- The third mosquito that I've
- 16 listed and the main driver behind the change
- 17 in our control plan is the Asian Tiger
- 18 Mosquito. The Asian Tiger Mosquito, which
- 19 I'm going to show you in a picture in a
- 20 slide, you will all recognize it, you've all
- 21 seen it. It's been here a few years now.
- 22 It's an invasive species which is not
- 23 originally from the New York area. We first
- 24 noticed it in the United States in Florida,
- 25 and it has slowly worked its way up. The

- 2 great fear with this is, following on its
- 3 heels of arriving in Florida and working its
- 4 way north, Dengay Fever has started to
- 5 appear in Florida. We have not been -- not
- 6 us, the federal officials have not been able
- 7 yet to declare that the Dengay Fever that
- 8 first appeared in Key West and has now moved
- 9 up into main land Florida is because of
- 10 this, but temporally it follows. So there
- 11 is an epidemiological link that makes it
- 12 likely that the Tiger Mosquito is the reason
- 13 that Dengay Fever has arrived.
- 14 The Tiger Mosquito is a daytime
- 15 mosquito. This is why so many people last
- 16 year said, right in the middle of the
- 17 afternoon, I can't use my backyard. There's
- 18 plenty of mosquitos. It was most likely
- 19 these Tiger Mosquitos. They're very hearty
- 20 and they bite during the day.
- 21 I just listed here, you all have
- 22 this in a packet that I gave to you, the
- 23 three diseases that we really worry about.
- 24 West Nile is now considered endemic. We've
- 25 had cases going back too many years in a row

- 2 for it not to be. I'm going to show you.
- 3 Dengay Fever which ravages parts
- 4 of Central America, Mexico, and other parts
- 5 of the world is a very unpleasant virus
- 6 that, when it doesn't just cause months of
- 7 horrible bone pain and fever, can lead to
- 8 death.
- 9 And the third is Eastern Equine
- 10 Encephalitis where horses are the main host.
- 11 Once in a while, a human will be an
- 12 accidental host. It's about a third of the
- 13 percentage of time fatal when it is in
- 14 humans. Horses most of the time are
- 15 vaccinated. We do have a large equine
- 16 community in the north shore, polo clubs and
- 17 areas where there's a lot of horses.
- 18 We haven't had this in Nassau
- 19 County, thankfully, but upstate counties did
- 20 have it last summer and the summer before,
- 21 small numbers of cases, but it brings home
- 22 the point that we have to be proactive about
- 23 mosquito control.
- We have 42 traps located in
- 25 secure places where they remain secure so

- 2 that the public or any other interest can
- 3 not get to them. I make sure I don't know
- 4 the locations. But we have them spread out
- 5 along the grid throughout the county. The
- 6 dots represent the areas where they are and
- 7 the red dots show traps that did test
- 8 positive for West Nile mosquitos during the
- 9 last year. As you can see, the pattern kind
- 10 of makes it so it's all around the county.
- 11 Yes?
- 12 LEGISLATOR BOSWORTH: I actually
- 13 have a number of questions. We've had such
- 14 a rainy --
- DR. EISENSTEIN: I will be
- 16 willing to stay as long as you want
- 17 answering questions. Thank you.
- Going to the next slide, we're
- 19 showing the total number of mosquitos
- 20 trapped. There really isn't a pattern, per
- 21 se, there's mosquitos all around the county.
- The next slide shows you, if
- 23 anybody recognizes this, is the Tiger
- 24 Mosquito, you cannot miss those stripes on
- 25 the legs. Even my kids recognize it. This

- 2 is the daytime biter that three or four
- 3 years ago was not here in Nassau County. It
- 4 is now here in numbers that makes it to
- 5 remain endemic. The fact that it's a
- 6 daytime mosquito makes it very difficult,
- 7 because spraying during the day, A, is not
- 8 nearly as effective at night because the sun
- 9 can deactivate it, but you also can't drive
- 10 down the street while kids are playing on a
- 11 summer afternoon and spray, so controlling
- 12 this mosquito is difficult.
- 13 Furthermore, this mosquito
- 14 requires very very little water compared to
- 15 others to reproduce, to lay its eggs. This
- 16 is a mosquito that if there's a little soda
- 17 bottle, water bottle cap that has a
- 18 millimeter of water in it, it can breed many
- 19 babies. It also does not need water to
- 20 live. So on a dry night, these mosquitos
- 21 are not out at night, they will gather
- 22 around bushes and little trees, in gutters,
- 23 and they live until water comes when they
- 24 breed. So this is really important that we
- 25 control this.

- These are the traps that had at
- 3 least 25 or more Tiger Mosquitos at a time
- 4 during the summer last year. As you can
- 5 see, there is kind of a band across the
- 6 south shore of the county, but no area is
- 7 not going to have the Tiger Mosquito. And
- 8 the black dots don't mean there was no Tiger
- 9 Mosquitos, it means there wasn't enough to
- 10 trigger at least 25 in a trip at a time, but
- 11 we expect Tiger Mosquito to be everywhere in
- 12 the county.
- There's a total number of
- 14 mosquitos trapped through the years 2005 and
- 15 2011, and a lot of last year being the
- 16 highest due to the tremendous amount of rain
- 17 and the storm that we had which created
- 18 mosquito breeding grounds.
- 19 When trees are knocked over and
- 20 the wet leaves lie, and in bushes, it
- 21 creates a tremendous amount of mosquito
- 22 breeding grounds, and that happens after we
- 23 work all year to maintain the sumps and
- 24 sites where mosquitos can breed.
- You know, sewers get backed up

- 2 and we work as best we can to clear it. I
- 3 know DPW can comment more on those efforts
- 4 if you have a question for them after, but
- 5 last year we trapped the most amount of
- 6 mosquitos that we have.
- 7 We also had last year, the next
- 8 slide, is the number of complaints. Last
- 9 year is 60 percent more than any year before
- 10 that. Most of it came when the storms came
- 11 at the end of the summer.
- 12 The next slide shows a little bit
- 13 of a relationship, pretty clear that the
- 14 year we have the most complaints is the year
- 15 we trap the most mosquitos. The people that
- 16 are complaining are not crazy. There are
- 17 more mosquitos. That's why it's difficult.
- 18 Next, this is a really important
- 19 slide which shows the number of positive
- 20 pools from West Nile Virus from 2005 to
- 21 2011. The reason I say it's important is,
- there is no years between 2005 and 2011
- 23 where there were no West Nile mosquitos.
- 24 West Nile is now considered endemic by us
- 25 meaning it's a virus that's part of our life

- 2 and we have to control it.
- In the beginning when West Nile
- 4 appeared in 1999, it was a year that we had
- 5 some, a year that we didn't, but now we know
- 6 that it's here. And what's really
- 7 important, I'm going to go through this
- 8 slide on to the next, this is the
- 9 correlation between positive traps of West
- 10 Nile and human cases of West Nile. The top
- 11 graph shows positive pools, the bottom graph
- 12 shows human cases.
- 13 If you notice, especially with
- 14 2010 and 2011, the overlap is remarkable.
- 15 When we trap large amounts of mosquitos
- 16 carrying West Nile, we know that humans are
- 17 going to catch the disease. The data is
- 18 pretty impressive here.
- So everybody says, what is going
- 20 to cause it to be a good or bad West Nile
- 21 year, and the fact is, scientists are just
- 22 learning this, but we do know that birds are
- 23 the natural host for the disease. Humans
- 24 are an accidental host. When birds are not
- 25 well, they're more likely to become infected

- 2 and they're also easier for mosquitos to
- 3 bite. So anything that stresses birds is
- 4 typically what makes a West Nile year bad.
- 5 So, yes, having large numbers of mosquitos
- 6 due to rain is part of the factor, but
- 7 they're more likely to be infected
- 8 mosquitos, for example, in 2010, when we
- 9 showed you in the slide before, was the
- 10 biggest year, but it didn't rain for about
- 11 three months straight. That stresses the
- 12 birds. The birds have to fly long distances
- 13 to find watering holes. The heat hurts the
- 14 birds and weakens them, and they are easy
- 15 for the mosquitos to get to.
- 16 So it's not only that the
- 17 rainiest season is going to be the most
- 18 dangerous season regarding mosquitos,
- 19 certainly we are going to have more
- 20 mosquitos most likely in a rainy season, but
- 21 this is a very multi-factorial thing trying
- 22 to determine what's going to cause mosquito
- 23 borne illness.
- 24 We've looked at various factors
- 25 that impact the population. We know, and

- 2 this is a very important point for you to
- 3 take back to your constituents, we know that
- 4 mosquitos don't fly more than two to 300
- 5 feet. The really hearty ones with a breeze
- 6 may make it 350 feet. The point of knowing
- 7 this is that the mosquitos on somebody's
- 8 property are their mosquitos. They're
- 9 yours. They're your pets. Any mosquito
- 10 that bites you in your backyard most likely
- 11 hatched in your property.
- Now, in some parts of the county
- 13 where the houses may be closer together,
- 14 maybe one property overlaps another. But
- 15 the mosquitos that are getting my kids in my
- 16 backyard are not coming from a different
- 17 legislative district.
- 18 And so the role that people take
- in protecting their property from mosquitos
- 20 is really important. When I speak with the
- 21 public, one of the number one messages is,
- 22 your mosquitos are your mosquitos, so please
- 23 protect your property. We're going to show
- 24 you a picture later of all the places around
- 25 the property that people don't even think

- 2 that we see on a daily basis harboring
- 3 mosquitos.
- 4 The numbers on the bottom of this
- 5 slide refer to CDC week. They're not dates,
- 6 but, as you see, West Nile positive
- 7 mosquitos generally come later in the summer
- 8 and that probably correlates with extended
- 9 periods of high heat and when birds get
- 10 stressed. So we haven't sprayed in May and
- 11 June even though there may be some mosquitos
- 12 because, traditionally, there hasn't been
- 13 virus at that time. That's just what this
- 14 slide is aiming to show you temporally.
- Now, what are we doing about it?
- 16 We are being very proactive because I don't
- 17 want to wait for a case of Dengay Fever.
- 18 There is debate in the science as to whether
- 19 Dengay Fever can even survive in this
- 20 climate. It's a horrible disease that we're
- 21 not waiting to find out.
- So, before you is a summary of
- 23 the very long control plan document that you
- 24 have. It says draft on it, just because
- 25 there are little typos on it and a couple of

- 2 little things that we're going to tighten up
- 3 and then send you the finalized copy, but
- 4 the main pieces of the plan are in place
- 5 now.
- 6 We've divided the plan into
- 7 various seasons. This first side shows what
- 8 we do in the off season, or what we call
- 9 winter. What are we doing at the end of
- 10 fall, after the mosquitos? By the way,
- 11 mosquitos will be active, it's considered,
- 12 until two nights consecutive of freezing
- 13 temperatures. Here, that could happen late
- 14 in October. So that's about when the
- 15 off-season begin.
- 16 Larval surveillance and control
- 17 is something done by DPW. Adult
- 18 surveillance and control, we still keep
- 19 looking evaluating the data. Public
- 20 education is a huge part of this. All this
- 21 is going to be on our website, by the way,
- 22 the Department of Health website.
- The next slide shows early
- 24 season. Early season, end of winter, early
- 25 spring, and I'm not going to read all of

- 2 this to you, but you can go through it if
- 3 you have any questions, we'll be glad to
- 4 discuss it.
- 5 This is a very summarized version
- 6 of a very long document but I want you to
- 7 have it.
- Peak season, where we are just
- 9 approaching. Talk a little bit about this.
- 10 Larval surveillance and control continues,
- 11 adult surveillance and control continues,
- 12 particularly monitoring human cases. Not
- 13 every county in New York State does it.
- 14 About 10 or 12 of them do. We always seem
- 15 to be one of the leaders in cases of West
- 16 Nile, so we are -- we work very hard at our
- 17 monitoring.
- 18 Late season towards the end, and
- 19 the slide that I really want to get to is
- 20 this one. Our proactive role in response to
- 21 constituent complaints. Many of you have
- 22 called me, have written me letters about
- 23 constituent complaints. They're perfectly
- 24 fair.
- 25 The first point I want to make.

- 2 Sometimes -- the majority of time, they
- 3 don't call you, they call either us or DPW.
- 4 I think DPW got the majority of complaints
- 5 last year. Every single complaint that
- 6 comes in, whether it's to you or to us or to
- 7 DPW is evaluated. Every single complaint.
- 8 And a site evaluation is performed. We look
- 9 to see, is it mosquitos, is there a source
- 10 of mosquitos, is it just routine mosquitos
- 11 that are normally there, or is there a risk
- 12 factor that can be mitigated by DPW, the
- 13 health department, the resident, or none at
- 14 all.
- 15 We look at the point-to-point
- 16 source. Let's say you give us an address.
- 17 We will look to see, are there pools with
- 18 stagnant water, fish ponds, artificial
- 19 containers, children's toys harboring water,
- 20 flower pots that have an inch of water that
- 21 just sits there for weeks. This is what the
- 22 experts on this do.
- 23 We identify the problem. If it's
- 24 larval, meaning it comes from -- if we want
- 25 to do larval control, it's a sump or a site

- 2 where we can prevent the mosquitos from
- 3 hatching in the first place, which DPW works
- 4 year round at that, then we do that.
- Is it a neighborhood complaint?
- 6 Did we find that, well, I've got 30
- 7 different residents within three square
- 8 blocks in two days who are going nuts. We
- 9 will evaluate the neighborhood. First
- 10 identify the species, that helps us
- 11 determine health risks. Determine breeding
- 12 sites. Apply appropriate larval control.
- When it gets to an entire
- 14 community, we are looking for the species,
- 15 we are looking for the sites. We have our
- 16 trap data within the community, and then the
- 17 key point, which is fifth down in the
- 18 widespread column, refer to the mosquito
- 19 control decision matrix. This is brand new
- 20 for Nassau County and it's something that I
- 21 felt very strongly about.
- I want you all to have our
- 23 algorithm now as to when we're going to
- 24 spray. I've gotten a lot of calls over the
- 25 years, why haven't you sprayed me? Why

- 2 haven't you sprayed me? Now we have an
- 3 algorithm that triggers spraying. So when
- 4 we do our investigation, and we see the
- 5 number of cases reaches where it should,
- 6 we're going to spray. It can't be
- 7 arbitrary. It can't just be, well, a few
- 8 people over there feel like there is a lot
- 9 of mosquitos, let's spray. Spraying carries
- 10 a lot with it. We have to make sure we're
- 11 doing the right thing by a community so
- 12 we're not creating more of a health hazard
- 13 than we're preventing. There is always a
- 14 risk benefit reward making medical
- 15 decisions. So that's how this algorithm is
- 16 based, on the most modern science regarding
- 17 risk benefit ratio and mosquito spraying.
- 18 So the next two slides with the
- 19 blue and orange lines talk about how many
- 20 mosquitos need to be in a trap to trigger
- 21 spraying, whether there's complaints or not.
- 22 And then, when there are complaints, how
- 23 many mosquitos do we need to see, how many
- 24 infected mosquitos.
- 25 So you can look that over. To

- 2 get to one of my favorite slides, the house.
- 3 This is in a flyer that I will be giving out
- 4 when I go do the rounds for the evening
- 5 events that's open to any of our residents.
- 6 I don't know if you can see the light
- 7 colored circles, but we really want to
- 8 emphasize to people that mosquitos are
- 9 breeding on their own property for the most
- 10 part. Sure, if they have a water front
- 11 house, if they have high tide, it will
- 12 create a lot of mosquitos.
- But, for the most part, we've
- 14 circled the swimming pool, the child's toy
- in the back, gutters is probably considered
- 16 number one. People leave leaves in their
- 17 gutters. All it takes is a little rain, a
- 18 two moist leaves stick together and
- 19 mosquitos can reproduce from that all year
- 20 essentially. So cleaning out gutters,
- 21 making sure there are no stoppage points in
- 22 gutters where a little puddle hangs out that
- 23 you don't see.
- 24 Bushes is really important,
- 25 garbage pails, people throw, when it's not

- 2 their garbage day, they put their garbage
- 3 pail, it rains, it collects, the cover sits
- 4 upside down with an inch of water in it may
- 5 be for a week. People really have to work
- 6 at clearing their own home for mosquitos.
- We're going to do our part, but
- 8 the residents have to help us too. One of
- 9 the analogies I use is, most people don't
- 10 call the health department and we're not
- 11 going to be able to come spray their
- 12 countertop for ants, it's a nuisance.
- So here it is too with the added
- 14 burden of disease, but people can spray
- 15 their backyards via exterminators or
- 16 whatever. I know before I have my
- 17 daughter's birthday party in my backyard,
- 18 I'm going to spray my bushes and make sure I
- 19 can do what I can on my own property while
- 20 the county will do what it can to help.
- 21 But it's got to be a public
- 22 partnership with us, the health department
- 23 and DPW to make this work. There always
- 24 will be some mosquitos. Mosquitos were here
- 25 before we were.

- 2 So we're going to do our best to
- 3 limit disease. We're going to be monitoring
- 4 year round. You all know that I call you
- 5 the second week at that first West Nile
- 6 mosquito thing, and thankfully I haven't
- 7 made that call to anybody yet this year.
- 8 But it will be here. We know it's in
- 9 Suffolk and New York City.
- 10 So this is a brief summary of the
- 11 plan. I know there's going to be a lot of
- 12 questions. I have flyers. The next two
- 13 slides show the flyer that's going to be
- 14 going out. And certainly, again, I want to
- 15 thank Commissioner Shah and her team and the
- 16 people from my team who have really worked
- 17 all winter.
- Just to tell you where I hope
- 19 this is going. I spoke to Ed Eisenstein,
- 20 the IT commissioner. Each year, after the
- 21 season ends, we're going to evaluate the
- 22 plan. This plan is going to go up on our
- 23 website. I hope that we get to a point
- 24 where in the future people can type in our
- 25 website their address and it will let them

- 2 know if it's sprayed, if it's going to be
- 3 sprayed.
- 4 There's so much we can do for
- 5 this to be friendly and responsive to the
- 6 constituents and it is a top priority for
- 7 us.
- 8 That's a summary of a very large
- 9 document and now I'm here with Commissioner
- 10 Shah and her team and Angela Petinelli from
- 11 my department to answer any questions that
- 12 you might have.
- 13 CHAIRWOMAN WALKER: Judi had the
- 14 first question, so go ahead.
- 15 LEGISLATOR BOSWORTH: Thank you.
- 16 First of all, Dr. Eisenstein, thank you so
- much.
- DR. EISENSTEIN: Thank you.
- 19 LEGISLATOR BOSWORTH: And
- 20 certainly I think we all are very grateful
- 21 for the wonderful job that the Department of
- 22 Health does, that DPW does, and Commissioner
- 23 Shah does so much -- there's so much
- 24 coordination and concern and terrific
- 25 attention given to this.

- DR. EISENSTEIN: Thank you.
- 3 LEGISLATOR BOSWORTH: It's very
- 4 appreciated by everybody. So just a few
- 5 questions. We have unprecedented heat now
- 6 and a very mild winter with very few days of
- 7 extreme cold. Do you believe that will
- 8 affect the number of mosquitos that we're
- 9 going to see this season?
- DR. EISENSTEIN: I believe it has
- 11 the potential to affect it, but the weather
- 12 patterns that we have going forward I think
- 13 are going to play a bigger role. The fact
- 14 that we've had these thunderstorms every few
- 15 days, that generally sets up for very large
- 16 numbers of mosquitos.
- 17 Interestingly, it doesn't
- 18 necessarily set up for large numbers of
- 19 disease because it spreads the birds out and
- 20 keeps the birds healthy in a sense, but I
- 21 think that being realistic, and based on how
- 22 last year finished and the fact that we
- 23 didn't have a horrible frozen winter to kill
- 24 off a lot of the mosquito larvae, I think we
- 25 potentially can have large numbers of

- 2 mosquitos.
- 3 Our trap data is showing large
- 4 numbers of mosquitos but we haven't
- 5 triggered a spray response yet. So it all
- 6 depends on what the weather pattern is. And
- 7 what is interesting is, there is nothing in
- 8 the scientific literature. We've searched
- 9 and searched for the answer to that
- 10 question. We are all hypothesizing based on
- 11 anecdotally what we see. And that kind of
- 12 makes this a little bit challenging.
- We are using the best science
- 14 available which isn't perfect on this, but,
- 15 to answer the question, I think it's likely,
- 16 especially if this weather pattern of
- 17 thunderstorms and high heat every few days
- 18 continues.
- 19 The other thing that happens when
- 20 you get high heat is that people water their
- 21 lawns more. That creates breeding grounds
- 22 too. I'm guilty of that myself.
- 23 So we are prepared for a very
- large number-wise mosquito season.
- 25 LEGISLATOR BOSWORTH: The other

- 2 thing that I find of tremendous concern is,
- 3 it once was, you can say to people, don't be
- 4 out at dusk, that's when the mosquitos are
- 5 really out, but you're talking about this
- 6 Tiger Mosquito that's out all during the
- 7 day.
- 8 So how do we help residents
- 9 protect themselves from getting and their
- 10 children from getting bitten if this kind of
- 11 mosquito is around all the time?
- DR. EISENSTEIN: It's a very
- 13 difficult question that health departments
- 14 that all around the United States are
- 15 grappling with. A couple of counties around
- 16 the United States have come up with plans.
- 17 We used some of what's been done before and
- 18 come up with our own ideas.
- 19 This is where a couple of things
- 20 have to happen. Number one, people have to
- 21 take care of their own property. The good
- 22 thing about the mosquito, the type of
- 23 mosquitos, we don't see it necessarily in
- 24 numbers like you do around dusk. You'll see
- 25 a few of them hovering around, but

- 2 definitely they have those new little Off
- 3 clips that clip on to their waistband and
- 4 give off a slight mist of mosquito spray.
- 5 We want people to use mosquito spray safety
- 6 when they can. We want people to make sure
- 7 that toys are not left outside with a little
- 8 bit of water in them.
- 9 Really, people need to maintain
- 10 their property in order to use them. It
- 11 wasn't always like that. You're right.
- 12 It's frustrating that it's here. So it's a
- 13 challenge. There is no other way to put it.
- 14 It is a challenge to work with the public to
- 15 try to protect their own property. That's
- 16 the way to do it and to protect their
- 17 children.
- 18 Certainly they need to keep their
- 19 bushes trimmed, keeping their gutters
- 20 cleaned, dumping any standing water, some
- 21 people have little bird feeders. That's not
- 22 a good idea. We're telling people not to do
- 23 that. I've taken all the bushes out of my
- 24 backyard. It's just grass and river rock
- 25 because I know that's a risk factor.

- 2 LEGISLATOR BOSWORTH: This is the
- 3 last question. We know that because of the
- 4 fiscal challenges that really every
- 5 municipal government is facing, there's been
- 6 cutbacks in departments everywhere. Is that
- 7 going to affect how we are monitoring the
- 8 traps or how we're dispensing whatever
- 9 services need to be serviced?
- DR. EISENSTEIN: Absolutely not.
- 11 We have changed nothing from how we've been
- 12 monitoring the traps. To this point,
- 13 mosquito control -- first of all, it's
- 14 mandated and it's a priority that I think
- 15 really, certainly, in my opinion, and the
- 16 support I've received from the
- 17 administration is such that this is of
- 18 utmost importance and, if anything, and I
- 19 think Commissioner Shah can comment on it,
- 20 we've actually I think grown in our mosquito
- 21 control response, and their number of
- 22 drivers, trucks, et cetera. But I don't
- 23 want to speak for her.
- 24 But to answer your question, from
- 25 my perspective, our efforts are stronger

- 2 than ever.
- 3 COMMISSIONER SHAH: Sheila Shah
- 4 from DPW. Yes, we have increased our staff
- 5 that has certified the Category 8
- 6 certification from what we had initially in
- 7 2010 to only a few actually went down to
- 8 one. Now we're back at 12. So at one point
- 9 we needed help from other municipalities,
- 10 that's not going to occur anymore. We have
- 11 sent our people for training, and they have
- 12 taken the exam. We have plenty of staff who
- 13 are available and certified to apply the
- 14 needed chemicals.
- 15 CHAIRWOMAN WALKER: Legislator
- 16 Gonsalves.
- 17 LEGISLATOR GONSALVES: Yes, Dr.
- 18 Eisenstein, you said that the breeding
- 19 ground is usually your own property,
- 20 however, if you're adjacent to a homeowner
- 21 who have large containers that have
- 22 accumulated water over the past several
- 23 months, wouldn't they be breeding on grounds
- 24 for mosquitos that can come on to your
- 25 property, in spite of the fact that you have

- 2 done everything that you could?
- DR. EISENSTEIN: Yes, we
- 4 certainly respond to those complaints, and
- 5 the way we would any other -- if you had
- 6 called us about a neighbor who has a lot of
- 7 rats on their property because they had
- 8 garbage in the backyard, our inspectors
- 9 would go and educate them and cite them if
- 10 necessary, do whatever has to be.
- We're going to do the same thing
- 12 as far as if someone gives us a complaint
- 13 that there's standing water because their
- 14 number has ten gallon drums that are open
- 15 and there's just billions of mosquitos.
- 16 That's exactly what I meant when we said we
- 17 respond to every complaint. That's a
- 18 complaint that we will send somebody out to
- 19 investigate.
- 20 LEGISLATOR GONSALVES: Last year
- 21 I had that situation next door where they
- 22 were doing construction. There were wheel
- 23 barrels, big drums, and I know that they did
- 24 contain water. I did call DPW and they
- 25 responded and found that they had to remove

- 2 the water and alerted the contractor, so
- 3 that they should be doing the same thing
- 4 from time to time.
- I don't know. There are people
- 6 that still have pools that have not been
- 7 treated. So how do we get the message out
- 8 to people, if these are your neighbors and
- 9 you know that these are breeding grounds for
- 10 the mosquitos, that they should call?
- DR. EISENSTEIN: Well, we're
- 12 going to do everything we can to have a
- 13 major educational campaign all throughout
- 14 the summer. We have new flyers showing what
- 15 type of mosquito everybody recognizes. I'm
- 16 going to be meeting with the public multiple
- 17 nights this summer all throughout the
- 18 county.
- 19 At every fair that we have, we
- 20 give out the flyers. At every event that we
- 21 attend, we have the flyers. There is no
- 22 magic to this with the water. Little
- 23 things, swimming pools, for example, just
- 24 keeping the water moving is so much less
- 25 risk than if the water is stagnant.

- 2 But we are going to try
- 3 everything. We are going to be putting --
- 4 our press officer is going to be asking the
- 5 cable channel TV station news if they can
- 6 put a little public service announcement
- 7 out. We are going to be trying everything
- 8 we can to get the message out. But,
- 9 ultimately, it is going to be up to people
- 10 to participate as our partners in this.
- 11 There is no magic.
- 12 LEGISLATOR GONSALVES: How will
- 13 the need for spraying be assessed and when?
- 14 DR. EISENSTEIN: The algorithm
- 15 that we have, not the one that I just
- 16 presented to you, I also passed out a draft
- 17 of the actual control plan. The algorithm
- is in there regarding how many mosquitos
- 19 versus how many diseased mosquitos versus
- 20 how many complaints in an area will trigger
- 21 spraying. That's based on the best
- 22 scientific data. I don't know the exact
- 23 number off the top of my head in a trap
- 24 before we would spray.
- 25 Certainly the presence of disease

- 2 very quickly triggers spraying. We want to
- 3 quell that right away. We want to make a
- 4 difference in the quality of life. We want
- 5 children to be able to play in their
- 6 backyards and people to enjoy the beach.
- 7 It's a big part of the summer here on Long
- 8 Island. But preventing disease has got to
- 9 be the number one thing that we look to do.
- 10 But we have the resources to
- 11 spray where we need, when we need to. We
- 12 just, quite frankly, haven't come close yet
- 13 to trigger where that's a productive move.
- 14 LEGISLATOR GONSALVES: I'm going
- 15 to go to the fact that if we spray our
- 16 shrubs, I have hate to tell you, I must have
- 17 sprayed our shrubs three times with a
- 18 so-called organic solution, and every time
- 19 we did it, guess what, it rained. So I
- 20 think our efforts were in vein. Only the
- 21 last time that we did it were we fortunate
- 22 for about three or four days not to have any
- 23 rain. But that is a problem. The fact is,
- 24 you try to do the right thing, but, at the
- 25 same time, Mother Nature just doesn't

- 2 cooperate.
- DR. EISENSTEIN: I agree, but the
- 4 example that I always use is Disney World.
- 5 Disney World is on a swamp in the most
- 6 mosquito ridden land that there is in the
- 7 world, yet you never get a mosquito bite in
- 8 Disney World, and that's because they spray
- 9 their property as soon as everybody leaves
- 10 after the fireworks and I think that's why
- 11 it is.
- 12 The fact is, they take care of
- 13 their property and the mosquito breeding
- 14 sites are eliminated. That's such a key
- 15 component of this.
- 16 LEGISLATOR GONSALVES: I live
- 17 around the corner from a residence where the
- 18 elderly gentleman succumbed to West Nile.
- 19 They treated him. I believe there is a sump
- 20 behind his home. And even though he's no
- 21 longer here, do they continually treat that
- 22 particular property since there was a
- 23 fatality?
- 24 DR. EISENSTEIN: West Nile is all
- 25 around the county. The fact that there was

- 2 a fatality in a certain location doesn't
- 3 mean that that person picked up that disease
- 4 at that location. He could have picked it
- 5 up anywhere in the county. The presence of
- 6 disease being everywhere doesn't mean that
- 7 there's more risk where that gentleman
- 8 succumbed. He was one of the unlucky
- 9 victims. West Nile is fatal in about one
- 10 percent, two percent of cases that get it.
- 11 There are various factors, I guess immune
- 12 factors that are involved. So the answer
- is, I wouldn't say that that area is any
- 14 higher risk than any other West Nile area
- 15 just because somebody there perished.
- 16 If you look at the deaths that
- 17 we've had for West Nile over the past
- 18 decade, they're really balanced throughout
- 19 the county, kind of similar to the trap
- 20 data.
- 21 LEGISLATOR GONSALVES: I know I
- 22 have neighbors who complain all the time
- 23 regarding mosquitos and their question to me
- 24 is, when is the county going to spray, and
- 25 your answer is?

- DR. EISENSTEIN: My answer is,
- 3 when we trigger our spraying response, when
- 4 the mosquito problem reaches a point where
- 5 we verify disease or a number of mosquitos
- 6 that are likely to produce disease, then
- 7 we'll spray. It's really very funny. I'll
- 8 get one call from someone saying, how come
- 9 you haven't sprayed me, and the very next
- 10 call will be that person's next door
- 11 neighbor who will say, don't you dare spray
- 12 my property, I don't want that chemical
- 13 sprayed on me.
- We do have to remember, although
- 15 it's very low risk and there's been no
- 16 evidence of human disease, spraying spray
- 17 over large amounts of property is certainly
- 18 not something that we want to do lightly.
- 19 We do it when there's risk, when we need to
- 20 do it, controlling mosquitos and improving
- 21 the quality of life, lowering disease. The
- 22 disease is a very important factor in this
- 23 that really allows us to do this.
- So, unfortunately, when somebody
- 25 says, when are you going to spray in my

- 2 area, there's not an easy answer to that.
- 3 The answer is, when the mosquito problem is
- 4 so bad in your area we can justify spraying.
- 5 Spraying is something that we have to
- 6 justify. We don't have the right to just go
- 7 and spray. Every time we spray, we have to
- 8 get it approved by New York State DEC.
- 9 Certainly the people who live
- 10 near freshwater wetlands are really at risk
- 11 because we're not allowed to spray on New
- 12 York State wetlands. We have them
- interspersed throughout our county.
- So we can't just decide, you
- 15 know, we're spraying this area. Every time
- 16 before we spray, we have to be approved for
- 17 it. We have partners that the DPW team has
- 18 made great partnerships with some of the DEC
- 19 leaders and they've gotten to know our
- 20 terrain and where we need to and where we
- 21 don't.
- 22 But spraying is a difficult
- 23 decision. It's an uncomfortable decision
- 24 sometimes. We are ready to do it. It's a
- 25 responsibility that I feel we have, but, you

- 2 know, I can't go anywhere without somebody
- 3 saying, when are you spraying me? I go to
- 4 my kid's graduation at school and 15 people
- 5 line up. I live on this street, make sure
- 6 you spray me. It's not that easy. We try.
- 7 Certainly when disease is involved, we run.
- 8 There is no surefire answers as to when are
- 9 you going to spray.
- 10 LEGISLATOR GONSALVES: Thank you
- 11 very much, Dr. Eisenstein.
- 12 CHAIRWOMAN WALKER: Legislator
- 13 Solages.
- 14 LEGISLATOR SOLAGES: Thank you
- 15 very much, Ms. Walker. Doctor and
- 16 Commissioner Shah, thank you very much for
- 17 this excellent presentation. It was a very
- 18 thorough presentation. I learned a lot
- 19 today. Thank you.
- DR. EISENSTEIN: Thank you.
- 21 LEGISLATOR SOLAGES: I see
- 22 according to Table C1 and other trap areas,
- 23 one location that hasn't been identified and
- 24 I have received knowledge from constituents
- 25 in my district as being an area of concern

- 2 is the Devcote (phonetic) Way Sports Complex
- 3 located near the intersection of Dutch
- 4 Broadway and Elmont Road. I understand that
- 5 you must pay attention to your algorithm and
- 6 you cannot respond to me by spraying, but I
- 7 ask you to please look into any complaints
- 8 or concerns regarding that area. This, as
- 9 you may know, is a large field that has
- 10 remained fallow, whether it's a sump, and,
- 11 of course, has retained its purpose as a
- 12 sump retaining water, however, many
- 13 neighbors have complained that many
- 14 neighbors have complained that many
- 15 mosquitos are now breeding.
- 16 To my understanding, there have
- 17 been some capital funds, at least \$500,000
- 18 designated to, whether it's a soccer field
- 19 or a cricket field, to my understanding, I
- 20 would like to know what is the progress of
- 21 that, because I understand you have to work
- 22 with the town on that project, and that may
- 23 have an effect upon the mosquito population.
- 24 Can you please shed some light on that?
- DR. EISENSTEIN: Sure. I just

- 2 want to say, while Commissioner Shah comes
- 3 up, I just want to be clear. There are
- 4 areas without traps. That doesn't mean they
- 5 don't get sprayed. So when we get a
- 6 complaint or you ask us to look into it, we
- 7 will investigate. If community-wide we find
- 8 that there is a mosquito problem there,
- 9 whether it triggers our algorithm or not,
- 10 they will qualify for spraying.
- 11 As Legislator Denenberg can tell
- 12 you, I live in Bellmore. There is no trap
- 13 in Bellmore. There is one on either side of
- 14 Bellmore, but that doesn't mean that we're
- 15 never going to be sprayed. Certainly when
- 16 the complaints come in, whether there's
- 17 traps or not, there is a place in the
- 18 algorithm for spraying as a result of
- 19 complaints. I will now let Commissioner
- 20 Shah answer.
- 21 LEGISLATOR SOLAGES: Thank you.
- 22 COMMISSIONER SHAH: Yes. If we
- 23 have received complaints about that area,
- 24 our staff will definitely be out there, or
- 25 they have been out there. We have to check

- 2 the records to see what they found while
- 3 they were there and the activity that took
- 4 place as a result of what they found. So
- 5 we'll check our records and go ahead and
- 6 address that area one more time. As far as
- 7 the Dutch Broadway project, the complex, I'm
- 8 going to have to look into it and call you
- 9 back but I do understand it's part of the
- 10 Environmental Bond Act projects that we are
- 11 conducting at the county.
- 12 As far as the status of that
- 13 goes, I will have to call you back on that.
- 14 CHAIRWOMAN WALKER: Legislator
- 15 Denenberg.
- 16 LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: Since I
- 17 have both of you up and you live in my
- 18 district, you certainly know first hand what
- 19 happens in Wantagh, Bellmore, Merrick every
- 20 summer, and the last two summers in
- 21 particularly, or last summer, I haven't seen
- 22 it yet this summer, although the season
- 23 seemed to have started earlier, around
- 24 Memorial Day both years, where I started
- 25 getting complaints from our neighbors who

- 2 were getting a number of barbecues or just
- 3 being outside even during the afternoon
- 4 where parties had to be brought inside or
- 5 children had to brought inside.
- 6 What is the reason why we felt a
- 7 heightened population earlier in the season
- 8 last year and this year in terms of -- I'm
- 9 going by complaints, as you said usually
- 10 people are complaining because they really
- 11 are getting bitten?
- DR. EISENSTEIN: Yes. You know,
- 13 it's funny. Our trap data isn't showing
- 14 tremendous differences from prior years. I
- 15 think that part of it is because of the warm
- 16 winter. There was talk in February, oh,
- 17 it's going to be a horrible mosquito season.
- 18 So I think there's a little bit of people --
- 19 LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: Although
- 20 last winter was much harsher, we had all
- 21 that snow in January and yet it seemed to
- 22 hit early too.
- 23 DR. EISENSTEIN: Well, you know
- 24 what's funny though, last year our data,
- 25 although the complaints came in early, our

- 2 data showed that big rain storm that we had
- 3 late summer really was when the mosquito
- 4 populations took off.
- 5 We don't have the data -- we
- 6 don't have the objective data that
- 7 corroborates the early season being
- 8 terrible. I'll tell you this. I know that
- 9 we had some investigators check a couple of
- 10 different sites along the water of the south
- 11 shore this year, even in my own area, just
- 12 from going out fishing at Jones Beach.
- 13 Earlier this year there was a
- 14 tremendous gnat population that bit people
- 15 and there were tons of bites, and the bites
- 16 look like mosquito bites. A couple of
- 17 complaints that I'm aware of that my people
- 18 -- my team went to evaluate ended up being
- 19 what was gnats, not mosquitos.
- But for people, when they wake up
- 21 with red itchy bumps, they don't know the
- 22 difference. So the complaints don't always
- 23 corroborate, but sometimes they do. So
- 24 that's why we get the complaints. Every
- 25 single one we go and evaluate. When we see

- 2 an area where multiple complaints are, in
- 3 fact, corroborative then we have an
- 4 indication to take action.
- 5 LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: Your
- 6 Section 8 in this report is adult control,
- 7 if I'm reading that correct, adult control,
- 8 which is chemical control spraying, and/or
- 9 hand spraying or aerial application or some
- 10 type of spraying application, and that
- 11 relies upon West Nile Virus being present.
- DR. EISENSTEIN: One of the
- 13 indicators.
- 14 LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: Before we
- 15 get to eight with adult control, seven,
- 16 larval control, and I guess this is more for
- 17 Commissioner Shah, larval control,
- 18 particularly if you look at the map, really
- 19 concentrates on the south shore, the barrier
- 20 beaches, and some of -- it looks like
- 21 preserves, Massapequa Preserve, Mill Pond
- 22 Preserve.
- So have we changed our larval
- 24 control at all? Have we increased it or
- 25 decreased it or is this --

- 2 COMMISSIONER SHAH: No. We
- 3 respond to the normal complaints that we
- 4 always get, whether they're -- whether the
- 5 product we use is specifically for issues
- 6 related to ponds or swimming pools versus
- 7 other areas like storm water basins which
- 8 require a little more long lasting type of
- 9 control. We're addressing them similarly as
- 10 we have done in the past. We monitor our
- 11 salt water marshes and we do spray there as
- 12 needed. We have twice this year, I believe,
- 13 sprayed there this year so far, to try to
- 14 keep the mosquito population under control
- 15 in those areas.
- 16 LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: Wait a
- 17 second. Just to be sure. We have the
- 18 ditches. Those are more of a natural --
- 19 once ditches are in place, we maintain
- 20 those, and the ditches work on their own, is
- 21 there application there, or is that just
- 22 feeding fish that eat the larvicides?
- 23 COMMISSIONER SHAH: I was talking
- 24 about the salt water marshes. That's where
- 25 we had the helicopter spraying.

- 2 LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: So that's
- 3 what we've done twice this year?
- 4 COMMISSIONER SHAH: Yes, twice
- 5 this year.
- 6 LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: What about
- 7 hand application?
- 8 COMMISSIONER SHAH: Hand
- 9 application has been going on for a while.
- 10 As the complaints come in, our staff goes
- 11 out and they take a look at what the
- 12 possible problems could be, whether it's
- 13 standing water due to a pool, pool cover,
- 14 ponds, catch basin issues that we might
- 15 have, any kind of standing water that might
- 16 be on the property, we address those areas
- 17 and we give out material to explain to the
- 18 homeowners or the property owners of what
- 19 the possible issues might be and how to
- 20 control it.
- 21 LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: Last year
- 22 we did the hand and aerial as well, or was
- 23 it less?
- 24 COMMISSIONER SHAH: Last year we
- 25 addressed complaints in the same manner,

- 2 yes.
- 3 LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: Was there
- 4 aerial larvicide application last year?
- 5 COMMISSIONER SHAH: At the salt
- 6 marshes, I don't believe so. Not at the
- 7 salt marshes.
- 8 LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: Was there
- 9 a reason for that?
- 10 COMMISSIONER SHAH: Well, we
- 11 conduct tests over there, dipping tests, and
- 12 based on the results of those dipping tests,
- 13 we conduct the spraying. This year the
- 14 tests indicated that there was a need for
- 15 it.
- 16 LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: We just
- 17 see what the population is in the marshes?
- COMMISSIONER SHAH: Yes. You see
- 19 what the population in the larvae is, and
- 20 based on that you make a determine to spray.
- 21 LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: So that
- 22 will do throughout the season?
- 23 COMMISSIONER SHAH: Yes, we will
- 24 continue to monitor that.
- 25 LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: Then adult

- 2 control, what are the factors we look at
- 3 before we can get the spraying?
- 4 COMMISSIONER SHAH: Adult
- 5 control, basically is a matter of taking the
- 6 traps that are out there, testing the
- 7 mosquitos, and determining the disease that
- 8 those mosquitos have.
- 9 LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: Then it
- 10 could be by spray truck, hand or aerial
- 11 depending on the need?
- 12 COMMISSIONER SHAH: That's not by
- 13 hand, that's spray struck. That's by
- 14 aerial.
- 15 LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: Okay. It
- 16 says right here, adult sites are not applied
- 17 by hand. So this year what we've seen so
- 18 far, there is no need for adulticiding as of
- 19 yet?
- DR. EISENSTEIN: Not yet. But
- 21 the numbers of mosquitos are high. They're
- 22 getting to where I'm sure at some point
- 23 we're going to reach the point, based on
- 24 what happens with the weather going forward,
- 25 we don't have West Nile yet, in 2010, which

- 2 was the worst West Nile year, we had deaths
- 3 in June. So now we are in July with zero
- 4 cases.
- 5 LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: Last year
- 6 it was like that too.
- 7 DR. EISENSTEIN: We find the
- 8 mosquito seasons evolved, quite frankly, in
- 9 the data last year, until that big rainstorm
- 10 late in the summer, we had a very light year
- 11 West Nile-wise and then, all of a sudden,
- 12 between that and the hurricane, August and
- 13 September and October even were complete and
- 14 total mosquito crazy, the amount of numbers.
- 15 So it is a process in fluctuation
- 16 which also makes it difficult, but we are
- 17 not there yet, but probably not far.
- 18 LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: Have we
- 19 stepped up larval control because of high
- 20 populations?
- 21 COMMISSIONER SHAH: We treat for
- 22 any kind of complaints that come in. So our
- 23 treatment is based on, right now, at this
- 24 point, mostly based on the complaints, and
- 25 then we go ahead and treat storm water

- 2 basins and monitor the salt water marshes
- 3 and things like that.
- 4 LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: Like you
- 5 said, the aerial applications that I was
- 6 familiar with and the salt marshes that so
- 7 far you indicated twice this year?
- DR. EISENSTEIN: We are going to
- 9 evaluate this process yearly and certainly
- 10 as new data becomes available and proof on
- 11 it. But I think the framework document that
- 12 you have is really important for us all to
- 13 have.
- 14 LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: And going
- 15 around as you both plan on doing, letting
- 16 people know in each district is important?
- DR. EISENSTEIN: Yes.
- 18 LEGISLATOR DENENBERG:
- 19 Particularly those districts where all those
- 20 dots are located like mine and so are other
- 21 south shore districts. Thank you.
- DR. EISENSTEIN: Thank you.
- 23 CHAIRWOMAN WALKER: Legislator
- 24 DeRiggi-Whitton.
- 25 LEGISLATOR DeRIGGI-WHITTON: Thank

- 2 you. I just wanted to ask you, no where in
- 3 here do I see it addressed as to what could
- 4 possibly be related to the spraying as far
- 5 as a negative impact on health of kids and
- 6 things like that.
- 7 Now, I understand the risk of
- 8 these diseases would possibly outweigh
- 9 those. But what are they? I do get
- 10 questions regarding that.
- DR. EISENSTEIN: I'll give from a
- 12 medical perspective and then maybe Sheila or
- 13 DPW guys might want to comment. The fact
- is, we haven't proven any risk based on the
- 15 spraying. The dose that we're spraying is
- 16 so minute that we have not shown
- 17 scientifically that there is any harm that
- 18 comes to human beings. I get asked about
- 19 pets, dogs, cats.
- 20 Certainly, though, we are
- 21 spraying a pesticide into the air in a very,
- 22 very minute dose, that goes out about 15
- 23 feet up and then settles down to the ground.
- 24 As it falls to the ground where it catches
- 25 the mosquitos that are hatching.

- We don't have evidence that this
- 3 causes human disease. It's 'a really
- 4 important point. It would be much more
- 5 difficult to spray if there was evidence
- 6 that this causes human disease.
- 7 Even people say, what about the
- 8 bird life? Even that seems to be very, very
- 9 low likelihood of effect. Certainly more
- 10 birds die from West Nile mosquito bites than
- 11 from the spray.
- 12 So the medical stance is, common
- 13 sense is, when you're spraying a pesticide
- in the air, it's not good for your health,
- 15 but there's no evidence that in the doses
- 16 that we're spraying, I wouldn't recommend
- 17 running right behind the truck. But in the
- 18 doses that we're spraying, we have no
- 19 evidence.
- 20 As a matter of fact, people
- 21 always call the call center when we spray
- 22 and say, I left my children's toys out back,
- 23 what should I do. By the morning it's been
- 24 deactivated and dissipated anyway after a
- 25 short amount of time, so the truth is, I

- 2 don't have to do anything but we say, all
- 3 right, if you're uncomfortable, either
- 4 spray it down. And in the sunlight, the
- 5 pesticide is deactivated and broken down.
- 6 There are people that worry about
- 7 this and there are people who feel it hurts
- 8 the environment. The fact is that we don't
- 9 have evidence of human disease as a result
- 10 of it and we feel that the benefit of doing
- 11 it certainly outweighs the potential risks
- 12 and side effects.
- 13 COMMISSIONER SHAH: And certainly
- 14 we take precaution when we do this, we give
- 15 out the proper notification, whether it's
- 16 through our website, through the
- 17 legislature, through the county exec's
- 18 office. We have proper notification. And
- 19 we also pick a time that there will be the
- 20 least amount of pedestrian activity. So
- 21 those two factors will limit people right in
- 22 the midst of our spraying.
- 23 LEGISLATOR DERIGGI-WHITTON: I
- 24 just wanted to follow-up with what Norma
- 25 said. Is there a difference with the

- 2 organic, or if you were going to do your own
- 3 bushes, do you notice a difference in the
- 4 efficiency of the organic versus chemicals?
- 5 DR. EISENSTEIN: I hire a
- 6 professional. I'm going to ask the mosquito
- 7 guys what the answer is. Anthony, want to
- 8 come up?
- 9 MR. FALCO: Anthony Falco,
- 10 mosquito control. Some people, they do call
- 11 us back and they recommend the Cutter bug
- 12 free instead of the organic. They say it
- 13 works better. That's what I'm getting from
- 14 the constituents, something like that.
- DR. EISENSTEIN: As this becomes
- 16 more and more of a hot topic, I think you're
- 17 going to see more products coming out and
- 18 information about the products on the market
- 19 because, like I said, people are going to
- 20 have to maintain their own properties
- 21 mosquito free if they're going to be able to
- 22 enjoy their property.
- 23 CHAIRWOMAN WALKER: Legislator
- Becker.
- 25 LEGISLATOR BECKER: I would guess

- 2 that the household items that you have in
- 3 your house could have more of a health
- 4 detrimental effect, like in some of the
- 5 things that we use, aerosols and whatever
- 6 else, I'll bet they have more of a chance of
- 7 causing us harm, that's probably a
- 8 statement. Do you agree with that? You
- 9 agree with that.
- 10 The other thing too is, I know
- 11 that we work very hard, and maybe this is
- 12 not something that can be evaluated, maybe
- 13 you partially answered it, we try to
- 14 encourage through our newsletters and others
- 15 and even the newspaper, I know you do it as
- 16 well, to avoid freestanding water, for
- 17 example, if you have a tire tube and it has
- 18 some water in it, or whatever else, does
- 19 that in fact actually help do you think in
- 20 the long run?
- DR. EISENSTEIN: It's the number
- 22 one proven technique for decreasing the
- 23 number of mosquitos on a property.
- 24 The fact is, without standing
- 25 water, the mosquitos can't breed.

- 2 Unfortunately, there's so many places in
- 3 that little picture of the house, and it
- 4 shows that nobody thinks of standing water.
- 5 Nobody thinks of their roof or their gutters
- 6 or things like that, but we know that
- 7 places, when we see that drum of water in
- 8 the neighbor's backyard, we know that
- 9 creates a mosquito hazard.
- So, the answer is yes, absolutely
- 11 I think it helps. And if I could just
- 12 comment on the household products, I think
- one of the concerns that I have is just
- 14 that, I don't know that the products are any
- 15 more dangerous, it's just that the people
- 16 using them may not be using them correctly.
- 17 Certainly they are being exposed
- 18 to different concentrations than the truck
- 19 which gives this appropriate amount of spray
- 20 at a very low dose.
- 21 LEGISLATOR BECKER: That's good.
- 22 I'm glad that you confirmed that that's
- 23 number one, so we will continue to use that
- 24 on our various newsletters. In fact, people
- 25 will call my legislative office and say, my

- 2 neighbor has got this thing in the back.
- 3 I'm going to call the health department. I
- 4 want him to remove it. I get quite a bit of
- 5 those calls during the year where people
- 6 want to stop their neighbors.
- 7 Would you send out a letter if we
- 8 got a complaint from somebody saying that
- 9 you have some freestanding water, or
- 10 whatever it may be, and would you please
- 11 abide by the county's --
- DR. EISENSTEIN: They'll get a
- 13 visit.
- 14 LEGISLATOR BECKER: Even better.
- 15 Would the commissioners show up themselves?
- DR. EISENSTEIN: If I needed to.
- 17 COMMISSIONER SHAH: Legislator
- 18 Becker, you also have to worry about things
- 19 that you dispose of into your recycling
- 20 basket. People tend to throw out bottles
- 21 that are still half full, or not even half
- 22 full is necessary. You can have a capful to
- 23 be able to breed mosquitos.
- 24 LEGISLATOR BECKER: That's a
- 25 great suggestion.

- 2 COMMISSIONER SHAH: This is one
- 3 of the big culprits.
- 4 LEGISLATOR BECKER: People often
- 5 have their recycle bins outside and you're
- 6 absolutely correct, a can can fill up with
- 7 water or something like that from the rain,
- 8 but I am taking my notes to let my
- 9 constituents know, but thank you. I
- 10 appreciate that.
- DR. EISENSTEIN: The key point
- 12 also, as Commission Shah said, which is
- 13 absolutely correct is, when we say standing
- 14 water, people get an image of a pool or a
- 15 giant bird bath. The fact is, we are
- 16 talking about a little bottle cap. That's
- 17 all it takes that you don't even see on your
- 18 property. That's enough standing water
- 19 especially for the new type of mosquito to
- 20 breed.
- 21 LEGISLATOR BECKER: Thank you for
- 22 all the information.
- 23 CHAIRWOMAN WALKER: I just had a
- 24 few comments before we close. One was
- 25 definitely before we would do any spraying

- 2 in any area, there would be phone calls made
- 3 to the constituents, all the constituents in
- 4 that area, so that is a definite that would
- 5 take place.
- DR. EISENSTEIN: Yes. That's the
- 7 law.
- 8 CHAIRWOMAN WALKER: And the other
- 9 was, I know you said you have flyers and
- 10 anything that you go to that you give them
- 11 out. Are those flyers going to be mailed
- 12 out to all the residents or just given out
- 13 at events or whatever?
- DR. EISENSTEIN: We haven't
- 15 mailed them to everybody. Certainly we have
- 16 a few thousand of them that we print at a
- 17 time to do the different events. But I'm
- 18 not opposed to giving anybody a copy of the
- 19 flyer to do whatever you like with.
- 20 CHAIRWOMAN WALKER: Or even
- 21 certainly if we let every legislator know
- 22 that any events that they might be having in
- 23 their communities, that they could have
- 24 those flyers to give out.
- DR. EISENSTEIN: And MaryEllen

- 2 Lorraine, who you all know as a
- 3 representative to the legislature, does a
- 4 lot of the educational events. And she,
- 5 besides being here, she's our director of
- 6 public health education. So she's at the
- 7 events with the flyers. So if you ever want
- 8 a stack of them, and you see her here, or
- 9 reach out to me directly, we'll get it to
- 10 you.
- 11 LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: When she's
- 12 not on the news talking about beach
- 13 closings.
- DR. EISENSTEIN: People forget
- 15 something as simple as, you know when you
- 16 get a full moon and you get that little bit
- 17 of extra high tide and the water comes up
- 18 and creates new puddles and activates new
- 19 larval sites, some of it, beyond all of our
- 20 events, nature rises the tide and there's
- 21 little puddles and standing water created.
- 22 This is a battle, us against the mosquitos.
- 23 It's consuming.
- 24 Certainly it's the busiest part
- 25 of my job as the health commissioner during

- 2 the summer. It's a huge percentage of what
- 3 we do. I think that our plan is going to
- 4 bring us to the cutting edge in response to
- 5 this.
- 6 CHAIRWOMAN WALKER: I just would
- 7 like to thank you, Commissioner Eisenstein
- 8 and Commissioner Shah, and everyone who has
- 9 worked along with you.
- 10 Thank you for this presentation
- 11 and for all the work you've done to get us
- 12 to this point. You certainly were very
- 13 educating to us here at the table, and
- 14 certainly things we don't even think about
- 15 like you said the recycling bucket, you
- 16 rinse out the bottles and you throw them in
- 17 the bucket quick.
- 18 LEGISLATOR GONSALVES: If it
- 19 rains tonight, and the little buckets
- 20 outside gather the rain, how long do we have
- 21 before we empty those buckets?
- DR. EISENSTEIN: Good question.
- 23 And this is why people can take care of
- 24 their property. It's estimated about seven
- 25 days of standing water before mosquitos can

- 2 breed in it. About seven days. Different
- 3 species might be off by a day or so. But
- 4 that means that if it rains tonight and you
- 5 go out tomorrow and dump all the standing
- 6 water, including the little bottle cap that
- 7 somebody dumped on your front lawn when they
- 8 just littered, you can really make a big
- 9 dent in the mosquito population.
- 10 LEGISLATOR GONSALVES: Good.
- 11 Thank you so much.
- DR. EISENSTEIN: So you don't
- 13 have to run out. You can take your time.
- 14 CHAIRWOMAN WALKER: And certainly
- 15 not that you're advertising any specific
- 16 products, but if we were unsure and we ask
- 17 and you gave us some ideas that would be
- 18 wonderful. And, certainly, even when you
- 19 said, even make sure about the kids having
- 20 the little clip-ons that they sell now.
- 21 They even sell little stick-ems, they look
- 22 like a dolphin or whatever. And even on
- 23 some of their toys that could be outside,
- 24 little playhouses or whatever that, like you
- 25 said, we don't necessarily think about that.

- 2 Even a small amount of water sitting
- 3 someplace.
- 4 I just can't thank you enough for
- 5 this presentation today. I think we all
- 6 have our work cut out for us too and we will
- 7 continue to work together to help to make
- 8 this problem less of a problem.
- DR. EISENSTEIN: Thank you.
- 10 CHAIRWOMAN WALKER: With that,
- 11 our hearing is closed. Motion to adjourn.
- 12 LEGISLATOR MUSCARELLA: So moved.
- 13 LEGISLATOR GONSALVES: Second.
- 14 CHAIRWOMAN WALKER: Moved by
- 15 Legislator Muscarella, seconded by
- 16 Legislator Gonsalves. All those in favor?
- 17 (Aye.)
- 18 Any opposed?
- 19 (No verbal response.)
- 20 I thank the Public Works
- 21 Committee and also the Health Committee for
- 22 being here today and all those others.
- 23 (Whereupon, the Health Committee
- 24 and Public Works Committee adjourned at 5:14
- 25 p.m.)

1					
2		C E R	RTIE	FICAT	<u>г е</u>
3					
4					
5	I, FRA	NK GRA	AY, a S	Shorthand	d Reporter and
6	Notary Publ	ic in	and fo	or the St	ate of New
7	York, do he	reby s	stated	:	
8	THAT I	atten	nded at	t the tim	ne and place
9	above menti	oned a	and too	ok stenog	graphic record
10	of the proc	eeding	gs in t	the above	e-entitled
11	matter;				
12	THAT t	he for	regoing	g transcr	ript is a true
13	and accurat	e tran	nscript	of the	same and the
14	whole there	of, ac	ccordin	ng to the	e best of my
15	ability and	belie	ef.		
16	IN WIT	NESS W	NHEREOI	F, I have	e hereunto set
17	my hand thi	s 24th	n day o	of July,	2012.
18					
19		_			
20				FRANK	GRAY
21					
22					
23					
24					
25					